

## Why Republics Are Superior to Monarchies and Aristocracies

America's government was fashioned as a republic.

This can't be stated enough. In fact, it must be hammered home over and over and over again, as the Left is constantly repeating the lie that the Framers of the Constitution created a democracy.

In explaining what makes America a republic, it is also important to emphasize what makes republics superior to democracies — something we here at *TNA* <u>have done</u> on multiple occasions.

But given the circumstances of the current political environment, it is also important to look at other forms of government monarchy and aristocracy — and examine why republics are more desirable to these systems as well.



Luis Miguel

To some readers, it may seem odd that such a case would have to be made. In the 21st century, are there really people who want to go back to an aristocracy or monarchy?

The answer, surprising though it may be to some, is "yes."

There is, in fact, a growing movement among the Right of those who have grown disillusioned with representative government. Such individuals, many of them young, rightfully identify democracy as problematic, but then decide that the answer is to abandon representation and elections altogether.

One of the reasons this segment of the dissident Right is gravitating toward monarchy is that we are witnessing an era of high tension in which people want decisive action. Extreme situations are a breeding ground for demagogues and strongmen, for during times like these people become fed up with gridlock and indecision. They want someone who will jump in, take charge, and swiftly get things done.

Pro-monarchists and pro-aristocrats also look at the correlation between the explosion of degeneracy and the decline of Christianity with the elimination of actual-ruling monarchs in the Western world.

There is some truth to what they observe. But again, the issue they have identified is not with all representative government, but with *democracy*. Democracy knows no moral limits or restraints. It is not constrained by God's word, nor by history, morality, tradition, hierarchy, or even common sense. Democracy is the act of handing over complete political power to the limitless appetites of the masses.

A republic, on the other hand, is rule by law, which should firstly be God's law.

Furthermore, it's crucial to point out that republics long existed in Europe, and there was no conflict with Christianity, nor was there a societal decline. Many of the great Italian city states were republics

# **New American**

Written by Luis Miguel on May 28, 2023



and yet flourished culturally, economically, militarily, and spiritually. The same can be said of the Dutch Republic. And the United States was a strong Christian country for about the first two hundred years' of its existence.

What makes the republic system strong is that it is a mixed government — it incorporates elements of monarchy, aristocracy, and democracy.

The analysis of these forms of government has been a recurrent theme throughout the history of philosophy. Aristotle addressed it in his writings. He classified monarchy (rule by the one), aristocracy (rule by the few) and polity (rule by the many) as the "true" forms of government that are for the common interest. According to Aristotle, when they devolve into ruling for the interest of their particular rulers, monarchy becomes tyranny, aristocracy becomes oligarchy, and polity becomes democracy.

Despite the fanciful ideal many pro-monarchists have of the system, the reality is that, throughout history, there are far too many examples of monarchies becoming tyrannies. For most of history, monarchs have ruled more for their own benefit and interest than for the public good.

Also, monarchies, like aristocracies and democracies, have tended to become oligarchies. In reality, oligarchy is the most common form of government in history and in the present day; most states, whether they claim to be a monarchy, republic, or democracy, are, in fact, ruled by a cabal of wealthy and powerful elites.

Such a cabal rules the world at large today, and are the ones who have brought Western civilization to the brink of collapse. Clearly aristocracy, when devolved into oligarchy, is also destructive.

For one of the problems with monarchies and aristocracies (and thus with tyrannies and oligarchies) is that while they begin as rule by the best, they quickly become merely rule by the heirs.

That is, a man becomes a king because, presumably, he is the strongest, most intelligent, most able leader in the realm. And so, at least for one generation, you have the "best" man leading the nation. But then his sons and grandsons take over, and his descendants rarely possess the same capacities their forefather did. So now you don't have the best serving as king, but merely the man who by accident of nature happened to inherit the throne.

It is the same with aristocracy. The aristocracy is supposed to be the most able members of the society. But over time, the new generations of aristocrats are not all that smart or able — they are merely lucky enough to be born into the right families.

A republic, which can be compared to Aristotle's "polity," has traits of monarchy through executives (presidents, governors) and aristocracy through the legislature (the members of the legislature are supposed to be the country's leading men, just as the likes of Washington, Jefferson, and other Founding Fathers were the landed gentry of their day).

But the monarchical and aristocratic elements in a republic are softened by the democratic element — the elections. So that instead of being a set, hereditary class of monarchs and aristocrats (who over time lose the spark of greatness their progenitors had), they are elected anew regularly, allowing for new men and new families to climb their way to the top — thus incentivizing the ascendance of the best.

Related articles/videos:



Written by Luis Miguel on May 28, 2023

**Overview of America** 





#### Subscribe to the New American

Get exclusive digital access to the most informative, non-partisan truthful news source for patriotic Americans!

Discover a refreshing blend of time-honored values, principles and insightful perspectives within the pages of "The New American" magazine. Delve into a world where tradition is the foundation, and exploration knows no bounds.

From politics and finance to foreign affairs, environment, culture, and technology, we bring you an unparalleled array of topics that matter most.



### Subscribe

#### What's Included?

24 Issues Per Year Optional Print Edition Digital Edition Access Exclusive Subscriber Content Audio provided for all articles Unlimited access to past issues Coming Soon! Ad FREE 60-Day money back guarantee! Cancel anytime.